Dynamic feedback between phenotype and physiology in sexually selected traits

Dustin R. Rubenstein¹,² and Mark E. Hauber³

¹ Department of Integrative Biology and Museum of Vertebrate Zoology, University of California, Berkeley, 3060 Valley Life Sciences Building, Berkeley, CA 94720, USA
² Department of Ecology, Evolution and Environmental Biology, Columbia University, Schermerhorn Extension, 10th Floor, 1200 Amsterdam Avenue, New York, NY 10027, USA
³ School of Biological Sciences, University of Auckland, Private Bag 92019, Auckland, New Zealand

Theory predicts that physiological costs of producing elaborate phenotypes assure the honesty of sexually selected traits. It is generally assumed that these physiological processes drive sexually selected displays. However, a recent study by Safran and colleagues demonstrates that the manipulation of plumage ornaments in barn swallows alters the temporal course of circulating androgens, thus rejecting the scenario of a static, unidirectional relationship between physiology and sexual displays. Instead, these results suggest that dynamic feedbacks between physiological, morphological and behavioural costs underlie the development and maintenance of sexually selected ornaments.

Physiology of sexually selected traits
Animals use elaborate displays in mate attraction and territorial defence. Honesty of these signals is often enforced by costly physiological processes that underlie the production and maintenance of sexually selected traits [1–3]. The proximate control of many such ornaments relies on hormones to regulate signal production [4]. Specifically, androgens, including testosterone, influence the expression of many ornamental traits in birds, particularly the melanin-based rusty, brown and black colours that commonly underlie avian plumage. Melanins are the most common avian pigment, and experimental androgen elevations can enhance melanin-based plumage signals used in mate attraction and social dominance [5]. These patterns support the theoretical framework that physiological traits unidirectionally drive sexually selected displays (Figure 1a) [6].

Morphology-hormone feedback in barn swallows
In a recent paper, Safran and colleagues [7] challenge the prevailing view that the relationship between hormones and morphological traits is static and unidirectional. The authors demonstrate that experimentally enhancing male plumage coloration in North American barn swallows Hirundo rustica erythrogaster (Figure 2) alters seasonal patterns of circulating androgens and body mass during the breeding season. Rusty ventral plumage in barn swallows is a melanin-based [8] sexually selected trait that influences female mate choice, reproductive timing and paternity allocation [9]. Darker males breed earlier in the season, have greater paternity and circulate more androgens than paler males [7,9]. One week after enhancing the ventral coloration of half of the males, experimental males had elevated androgens but decreased body mass, whereas control males showed the typical seasonal decline in androgens and increase in body mass.

The positive correlation between circulating androgens and coloration in premanipulation males [7] suggests that androgens are mechanistically linked to melanogenesis and pigmentation, or that there is an ongoing behavioural feedback on androgens related to ventral coloration as a social cue. Given that the colour manipulations in this study were done outside of the natural moulting period of barn swallows, it is likely that the increases in androgens were the result of behavioural interactions resulting from the manipulations. The real surprise of this study, however, is that a phenotypic enhancement led to such rapid changes in circulating sex steroids of males. These results demonstrate that the relationship between androgens and ornaments is not fixed (Figure 1a), but rather a dynamic process involving feedback between

Glossary
Androgen: steroid hormones most often associated with masculinisation. The most common androgen in vertebrates is testosterone.
Challenge Hypothesis: hypothesis proposed to explain the social modulation of androgens in males in a seasonal context. It describes how social interactions can lead to increased circulating androgens in animals, helps explain why androgens in males vary seasonally and predicts how male androgen levels relate to social systems.
Corticosterone: the primary gluocorticoid in most non-mammalian vertebrates. It is released from the adrenals in response to a variety of social and environmental stressors.
Glucocorticoid: steroid hormones produced in the adrenals in response to stimulation along the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis. The most common glucocorticoids in vertebrates are corticosterone and cortisol. Glucocorticoids affect many aspects of vertebrate physiology and behaviour and predominantly regulate energy balance.
Hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal (HPA) axis: describes the hormonal cascade resulting in glucocorticoid release. Corticotropin-releasing hormone (CRH) secreted from the hypothalamus stimulates the pituitary to secret adrenocorticotropic hormone (ACTH), which in turn stimulates glucocorticoid production in the adrenals.
Melanin: the most widespread group of pigments in animals that yield many of the black, brown and buff shades seen in plants, fungi and animals.
Melanogenesis: the formation of melanin in melanocyte cells.
Testosterone: an androgenic steroid primarily secreted from the gonads of vertebrates. It stimulates seasonal reproductive behaviours such as courtship, sexual behaviours, territorial aggression and song, and plays an important role in the production of sperm and a variety of secondary sexual characters.
morphological signals and physiological traits, likely indirectly via social interactions (Figure 1b).

**Androgen–morphology interactions: a complex and changing system**

Androgens have long been known to seasonally modulate vertebrate reproductive behaviours. The Challenge Hypothesis formalised the relationship between circulating androgen concentrations in male vertebrates and seasonal patterns of intrasexual aggression [10]; in essence, it was the first model of dynamic feedback between androgens and sexually selected traits. It sought to not only explain seasonal androgen patterns and their relationship with paternal care and mating systems (i.e. hormonal regulation of behavioural traits) but also to predict how males would hormonally respond to intraspecific social challenges (i.e. behavioural feedback upon hormones) (Figure 3).

Despite the known bidirectional relationship between androgens and reproductive behaviours, it is nonetheless surprising that androgens have a similarly dynamic role with sexually selected morphological traits, including plumage coloration. The enhancement of plumage ornamentation in barn swallows reversed a seasonal decline in androgens (Figure 3), suggesting that differences in the timing of seasonal androgen declines among males could be related to temporal variation in the brightness of ventral coloration, rather than the other way around. Such a hypothesis predicts that darker males continue to show androgen-related reproductive behaviours longer into the breeding season, and thereby increase their fitness. Moreover, dynamic hormone–trait feedbacks could be an adaptive mechanism to help fine-tune the link between behaviour and ornament expression in complex social societies where phenotype and fitness vary greatly among males.

**Future directions**

These novel results on hormone–morphology relationships in barn swallows suggest a more complicated view of the physiological causes and consequences of vertebrate sexually selected ornaments than is generally theorised [3–5]. To help elucidate these issues, future studies must examine (i) the behavioural and physiological mechanisms by which androgen–ornament feedbacks are maintained, and (ii) the role that other hormones, including glucocorticoid stress steroids, play in dynamic feedbacks of melanin-based signals. We briefly discuss these aspects below.

**Androgens and the maintenance of honesty**

Although behavioural observations were not conducted in the barn swallow study, it is possible that social cues, through the enforcement of honest badges of status by other males [11] or increased sexual interest by females [9], mediated the interaction of experimental changes in colour, androgens and body mass in barn swallows. Whereas androgen-based traits are typically considered costly because of the tradeoffs of high circulating steroid levels on other physiological functions [6], in some species melanin-based ornaments might be relatively cheap to produce but have high social maintenance costs [11]. Indeed, body mass rapidly decreased in enhanced compared to control males, suggesting that physiological costs enforced by behavioural interactions maintain the honesty of ventral coloration in barn swallows. Thus, ornaments might be more costly to express and maintain than was previously assumed because physiological costs are not just incurred during signal development, but also throughout the season or lifetime owing to social feedbacks.

**Glucocorticoids, androgens and honest ornaments**

Although androgens are most often studied in relation to honest signalling of avian plumage, glucocorticoids (corti-
Cortosterone in birds) can also be important in regulating behavioural and morphological traits under sexual selection (Figure 1c). Glucocorticoids are related to vocal displays in a variety of vertebrates, and increased glucocorticoids can decrease melanogenesis in avian plumage [12]. Melanocortin receptors, critical for melanogenesis, play an equally important role in stress physiology by initiating the hormonal cascade along the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis [13]. Moreover, chronic stress and corticosterone elevation inhibit testosterone production in many birds [4]. Future work should examine androgens and glucocorticoids simultaneously to determine whether glucocorticoids exhibit similar dynamic feedbacks as androgens with sexually selected traits (Figure 1c).

Conclusion

Simple models of fixed pathways between hormones and traits clearly do not encompass the full range of complexity surrounding the causes and consequences of sexually selected signals. Dynamic feedbacks from hormones are not only important for influencing behavioural traits, but could also be important in driving the production and maintenance of morphological traits. Moreover, within-population variation in male quality might not only lead to variation in ornament production and maintenance that honestly advertises differences in male quality but the ornaments themselves might further influence seasonal patterns of androgens and local adaptations to honestly signal quality, leading to intra- and interpopulation differences in sexually selected displays and signals [9,14]. Thus, dynamic hormone–trait feedback might be an adaptive mechanism to help fine-tune the link between behaviour and ornament expression in complex social societies where phenotypes and fitnesses vary greatly among males. Further studies with additional hormones (glucocorticoids, estrogens) in avian species that use different mechanisms for plumage production (carotenoids, structural colours, iridescence) and in taxa that use other types of morphological signals (horns, antlers, eyestalks) will help determine whether dynamic feedbacks between endocrine physiology and morphological signals are as common in vertebrates as are the feedbacks between hormones and behavioural displays.

Acknowledgements

D.R.R. was funded by a fellowship from the Miller Institute for Basic Research in Science at the University of California, Berkeley, and M.E.H. was funded by the New Zealand Marsden Fund and the Human Frontier Science Programme.

References


0169-5347/S – see front matter © 2008 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.
doi:10.1016/j.tree.2008.07.010 Available online xxxxxx